

Joseph J. Bell, Esq. (016881985)  
Bell, Shivas & Bell, P.C.  
150 Mineral Springs Drive  
P.O. Box 220  
Rockaway, NJ 07866  
Attorneys for Defendant, Holly Mackey, Warren County Clerk

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY

ANDY KIM, in his personal capacity  
as a candidate for U.S. Senate, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

CHRISTINE GIORDANO HANLON,  
in her official capacity as Monmouth  
County Clerk, et al.,

Defendants.

Case No.: 3:24-cv-01098-ZNQ-TJB

**SUPPLEMENTAL  
CERTIFICATION  
OF HOLLY MACKEY,  
WARREN COUNTY CLERK**

I, Holly Mackey, being of full age, hereby certify as follows:

1. I am the duly-elected County Clerk for the County of Warren (“County” or “Warren County”). I have served in this capacity since 2018. I make this supplemental Certification in support of the Brief submitted in response to the Complaint and Reply Brief of March 12, 2024 filed by Plaintiffs in the above-captioned matter. I have personal knowledge of the facts set forth herein.

2. This supplemental Certification is submitted as a clarification to my previous Certification. Specifically, this relates to my experience with the technical capabilities of the ES&S ballot and voting system utilized by the County of Warren, including as to the ES&S express machines which are utilized for touch screen electronic ballots.

3. The ES&S system utilized by the County of Warren has the ability to technically allow a **paper** ballot design which is either based on a bubble ballot or bracketing of candidates, including the use of a county organizational line (“organizational line”) at the request of a county or local political party organization. I have experience using ES&S for the creation of a bubble ballot for paper ballots only, including those referenced in my previous Certification in 2018 and 2019 elections. I do not have any experience or knowledge as to whether the ES&S express machine would have the technical capabilities to design a bubble ballot for use on a touch screen electronic voting machine. My reference to the 2020 General Election describes the use of paper and electronic ballots which allowed for bracketing, and which were not designed in a bubble ballot format.

4. As of March 2024, the practical effect is that the County of Warren can design a **paper** ballot that either contains bracketing, which may or may not include an organizational line, or a bubble ballot, which could include the use of a common slogan by groups of candidates at the request of candidates and/or county or local

political party organization. I have never been presented with a situation where a bubble ballot has been requested for use on an ES&S express touch screen machine. Therefore, I have no knowledge or experience as to whether such a use is even technically feasible. I wish to provide this clarification in connection with the factual and legal issues presented in advance of the hearing scheduled for March 18, 2024.


5. I certify that the foregoing statements made by me are true. I am aware that if any of the foregoing statements made by me are willfully false, I am subject to punishment.

By: \_\_\_\_\_  
Holly Mackey

Dated: March 15, 2024

political party organization. I have never been presented with a situation where a bubble ballot has been requested for use on an ES&S express touch screen machine. Therefore, I have no knowledge or experience as to whether such a use is even technically feasible. I wish to provide this clarification in connection with the factual and legal issues presented in advance of the hearing scheduled for March 18, 2024.

5. I certify that the foregoing statements made by me are true. I am aware that if any of the foregoing statements made by me are willfully false, I am subject to punishment.

By:   
Holly Mackey

Dated: March 15, 2024